

NEW BOOKS NOW AVAILABLE FROM THE PALI TEXT SOCIETY.
(Order from: Pali Text Society, 73 Lime Walk, Headington, Oxford OX3 7AD.)

Group of Discourses II.

This volume contains a newly revised translation of the *Suttanipāta* together with K.R. Norman's extensive notes on the text, commentary and translation. It replaces and supersedes Volume I, which is now only available in the paperback version entitled *The Rhinoceros Horn*. The *Suttanipāta* is one of the oldest Pāli texts and contains much material about the Buddha's life, as well as discourses on many of the fundamental teachings of the Buddha. £24.50.

K.R. Norman: Collected Papers.

Volumes I to IV of the articles of the Pali Text Society President have now been published, thus bringing the collection up to date. These volumes contain articles covering K.R. Norman's work in the fields of Pāli language and lexicography, the Aśokan inscriptions and Middle Indo-Aryan studies, making this important body of scholarship easily accessible for scholars and students. £17.25 per volume.

Journal of the Pali Text Society.

Volumes XVI, XVII, XVIII and XIX have all been recently published. Volume XVI contains several articles, including an English translation of the *Rūpārūpavibhāga*; an article concerning the identification of South-East Asian manuscripts, and a long article by the PTS Research Student in Thailand, Peter Skilling, on *rakṣā* (protective) literature such as the *paritta*. Volume XVII contains a long study, by Dr E.G. Kahrs, of part of the Pāli Grammar, the *Saddanīti*. Volume XVIII again contains several articles, including the text of the popular Thai story of the Elder Māleyyadeva with a translation by Steven Collins. There are also articles by Charles Hallisey, K.R. Norman, Peter Skilling and another PTS Research Student, Jinadasa Liyanaratne, and an index of JPTS Volumes IX to XVIII. Volume XIX contains a long article by Peter Skilling on Theravādin literature in Tibetan translation, and a survey of the Burmese and Siamese manuscripts in the Wellcome Institute Library by Jacqueline Filiozat. It also contains a further contribution by Mme Filiozat and articles by K.R. Norman and Thiradhammo Bhikkhu. £15.50 per volume.

Udāna.

The *Udāna* is a collection of 'solemn utterances' made by the Buddha on special occasions and accounts of their circumstances. It contains many central teachings, such as the five factors that should be cultivated by one with an undeveloped mind; the importance of living in the moment, and so on. It also affords a fascinating glance into the world of the early Buddhists. Peter Masefield's translation of the text is now available, priced at £17.95. Dr Masefield (a PTS Research Student who has also translated two other commentaries for the Society), is currently completing a translation of the commentary on the *Udāna*, the first volume of which will appear in June 1994 and the second volume at the end of 1994.

Wilhelm Geiger: Pāli Grammar.

Our President, K.R. Norman, has revised the grammatical portion of Ghosh's English translation of the well-known work by the great German scholar in an attempt to suit the needs of both academics and those beginning their study of Pāli. In this version, which includes an Introduction entitled "What is Pāli?" by Professor R.F. Gombrich, the dense paragraphs of the original have been separated out and the number of references reduced. In changing the format of Ghosh's work, it became possible to make necessary corrections and additions to the text and to bring the references up to date. It is available in paperback at £6.75 and hardback at £12.95.

THE SYNONYMS OF NIRVĀṆA ACCORDING TO PRAJÑĀVARMAN, VASUBANDHU AND ASAṄGA

Peter Skilling

1. Synonyms of Nirvāṇa according to Prajñāvarman

Prajñāvarman's commentary on the *Udānavarga*, the *Udānavarga-vivaraṇa*¹, is a mine of brief citations from the sūtra literature of the (Mūla-)Sārvāstivādins. In this paper I will discuss one such citation, described by the author as from the *Sūtrānta-peyāla². The citation reads as follows³:

... mdo sde be-ya la las mya ngan las 'das pa'i rnam grangs
brjod de | 'di ltar 'dus ma byas dang | lta bar dka' ba dang |
mi 'gyur ba dang | mtha' yas pa dang | zag pa med ppa
dang | gnas dang | gling dang | skyob pa zhes rgya cher
gsungs so ||

... the synonyms (*paryāya*) of Nirvāṇa are given in the *Sūtrānta-peyāla, where they were taught [by the Lord]⁴:

(1) unconditioned (*asaṃskṛta*),

1 Michael Balk (ed.), *Prajñāvarman's Udānavargavivaraṇa*, 2 vols, Bonn 1984. Hereafter referred to as *UvViv*. References to the *Udānavarga* (*Uv*) are to Franz Bernhard (ed.), *Udānavarga*, 2 vols, Göttingen 1965-8.

2 *Mdo sde be-ya la*: *mdo sde* = *sūtrānta* (or also simply *sūtra*); on the evidence of the Pāli parallel discussed below, I take *be-ya* to be a transliteration of *peyāla*.

3 *UvViv* I 243.19, commenting on *Uv* 4.5.

4 The Tibetan verb *gsungs* is in an honorific form. In an otherwise un-attributed citation it usually refers to the word of the Buddha; in this case, since the citation is from a sūtrānta (*mdo sde*), it should be *Buddhavacana* from a canonical text.

- (2) difficult to see (*durdrśa*),
- (3) unchanging,
- (4) endless (*ananta*),
- (5) untainted (*anāsrava*),
- (6) shelter (*layana*),
- (7) island (*dvīpa*),
- (8) protection (*trāṇa*), and so on (*vistareṇa*).

Though the meaning of all the terms is clear in Tibetan, the Sanskrit equivalents of numbers 3 and 4 pose difficulties: for a discussion of these see the Appendix.

The term *peyāla* (Pāli *peyyāla*) is used in Buddhist texts to indicate abbreviation⁵. The title and list given in the Udāna-varga-vivaraṇa may be compared with the list of thirty-three synonyms of Nibbāna, also starting with 'unconditioned' and given in abbreviated or *peyāla* form, in the Asaṅkhata-saṃyutta of the Saṃyutta-nikāya⁶. The full list is given in Table 1A; the following seven items, in order of their appearance in Pāli, are common to both texts:

- (1) unconditioned (*asaṅkhata*),
- (2) unbent (*anata* — for this term, see the Appendix),
- (3) untainted (*anāsava*),
- (7) very difficult to see (*sududdasa*),

5 Cf. T.W. Rhys Davids and William Stede, *The Pali Text Society's Pāli-English Dictionary*, repr. London 1972, p.473a; Franklin Edgerton, *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar and Dictionary*, Vol.II, *Dictionary*, [New Haven 1953] Delhi 1972 (hereafter BHSD), 354a. Cf. also Uv, Ch.XXIV, *Peṇḍala-varga, sgre ba'i tshoms*, and UvViv II *bsgre ba'i tshoms*: in these cases *peyāla* is translated rather than transliterated.

6 For this study I have consulted the Pali Text Society (PTS), Chaṭṭhasaṅgīti (ChS), Syāmrāṭṭha (SyR) and Nālandā (N) editions: PTS IV 359-73; ChS [II] 535-43; SyR Vol.18, 441-54; N IV 312-20.

- (29) island (*dīpa*),
- (30) shelter (*leṇa*),
- (31) protection (*tāṇa*).

The term *peyyāla* is used in two main contexts in the Pāli Suttapiṭaka.

(i) In the longer suttas of the Dīgha- and Majjhima-nikāyas, it indicates a partial, internal abbreviation within a sutta, and refers to an earlier passage in the same sutta or in an earlier sutta, to be supplied with appropriate changes, such as the name of the person addressed, etc.

(ii) In the shorter suttas of the Saṃyutta- and Aṅguttara-nikāyas, *peyyāla* frequently indicates a virtually total abbreviation, since an earlier sutta is to be reproduced in full, with the substitution of a single word or phrase.

An example of the latter is the above-mentioned Asaṅkhata-saṃyutta⁷. The first *vagga* (chapter) opens with one sutta given in full, which defines the unconditioned (*asaṅkhata*) as the destruction of attachment, aversion and delusion (*rāga-, dosa-, moha-kkhaya*), and the path to the unconditioned (*asaṅkhata-gāmi magga*) as mindfulness of the body (*kāyagatā sati*). This is followed by ten suttas in *peyyāla* form in which a new term for the path to the unconditioned — from 'calm and insight' (*samatho ca vipassanā ca*) up to 'the noble eightfold path' (*ariyo aṭṭhaṅgiko maggo*) — is to be introduced to replace 'mindfulness of the body', making a total of eleven suttas. This completes the first *vagga*, at the end of which comes a verse summary (*uddāna*) of eleven key phrases, one for each of the

7 Cf. G.P. Malalasekera (ed.), *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism*, Vol.II, fasc.1, [Colombo] 1966, pp.150 ('Asaṅkhata'), 150-1 ('Asaṅkhata-saṃyutta'), 151 ('Asaṅkhata-sutta').

eleven suttas: *kāyo*, *samatho*, *vitakko*, and so on⁸.

The second *vagga* opens with a series of *peyyālas*, all referring back to the first sutta, which, by making one sutta each for each individual item of the groups listed in suttas 2 to 11 — one for 'calm' (*samatha*), one for 'insight' (*vipassanā*), and so on, up to one for each of the eight limbs of the path — gives us forty-five new suttas. Thus there are a total of fifty-six suttas dealing with *asaṅkhata*.

Asaṅkhata, however, is only one of many names for the goal of Buddhist practice, Nirvāṇa or Nibbāna. There therefore follows thirty-two synonyms of *asaṅkhata*, for each of which fifty-six suttas are to be made on the analogy of the *asaṅkhata* suttas⁹, thereby giving us another 1,792 suttas. When these are added to the original fifty-six 'asaṅkhata' suttas we get a total of 1,848 suttas in the *Asaṅkhatasamyutta*, condensed to a mere fifteen pages in the Pali Text Society edition, thirteen pages in the *Syāmrattā* edition, or nine pages in the *Chatṭhasaṅgīti* and *Nālandā* editions¹⁰. Thus the *Asaṅkhatasamyutta*

8 PTS 361,26–31; ChS 537.10–13; SyR 443.7–10.

9 Cf. PTS 361.26, 373.18; ChS 541.9, 543.8, *yathā asaṅkhatam tathā vitthāretabbam*; SyR 450.3, 453.14, *yathā asaṅkhatam vitthāritam tathā vitthāretabbam*.

10 The *Nālandā* agrees with the *Chatṭhasaṅgīti* edition, on which it is primarily based. Different manuscript traditions often vary in their treatment of *peyyālas*, in this case, for example, the *Syāmrattā* edition agrees on the order and number of items enumerated, but abbreviates the passages quite differently from the PTS edition. Similarly, Léon Feer notes for the *Mahāvagga* (S V vi): 'The Sinhalese and Burmese MSS. differ so much in the manner and quantity of their abbreviation that they seem to have nothing in common, although they are dealing with the same subject'. An abbreviated citation in the *Visuddhimagga* (Harvard Oriental Series ed. 242 ult–243.4; Thai

may justly be described as a *peyyāla* text *par excellence*. The second *vagga* and the *samyutta* as a whole end with another *uddāna*, listing the thirty-three synonyms¹¹. It is perhaps noteworthy that the *uddāna* contains the phrase *etaṃ sugatena desitaṃ*, 'this was taught by the Sugata [the Buddha]'.¹²

Similar examples of *peyyāla* collections occur throughout the *Samyutta-nikāya*; they are particularly common in each of the twelve *samyuttas* of the last division, the *Mahāvagga* (S V). In the *Mahāvagga*, several of the *peyyālas* are given individual names, such as *Aññatitthiya-*, *Suriya-*, *Ekadhamma-* and *Gaṅgā-peyyāla*; the last is common to eight of the twelve *samyuttas*¹². *Peyyālas* are also common throughout the *Anguttara-nikāya*, and may be said to represent a later phase of the Canon, a stage of mechanical multiplication and systemisation of the implications of the Buddha's teachings.

In addition to that of the *Asaṅkhatasamyutta*, several other lists of synonyms of Nibbāna are found in Pāli literature. The *Nettipakaraṇa* gives numerous similes (*vevacana*) of recollections of the Dhamma (*dhammanussati*)¹³: a prose passage, followed by a part of the *uddāna* of the *Asaṅkhatasamyutta* (Nos.1–23) and a number of untraced verses, giving 28 synonyms to total 51 (see Table 1B). The *Kathāvatthu* gives shorter prose lists in the context of the *nirodhakathā*¹⁴ and the first six *kathā* of the sixth

script *Mahāmakuṣarājavidyālaya* ed. II 89.15–19), in the context of 'recollection of peace' (*upasama-anussati*), reduces the *Asaṅkhatasamyutta* to four lines.

11 PTS 373.19–31; ChS 543.10–16; SyR 453.16–454.2.

12 Cf. S V, Introduction pp.v–vii.

13 BhB (Bhūmibalo Bhikkhu Foundation ed.) 80.9–82.15; ChS 47.3–26; PTS 55.1–24; cf. *Netti-aṭṭhakathā* (ChS) 119.17–120.18, and *Netti-tīkā* (ChS) 77.11–16.

14 Kv 2.11, pp.225–6.

*vagga*¹⁵; *nirodha*, *tāṇa*, *leṇa*, *saraṇa*, *parāyaṇa*, *accuta*, *amata*, *nibbāna*, *asaṅkhata*. The Paṭisambhidāmagga lists 40 attributes of Nibbāna along with their opposites, the characteristics of the five aggregates (*khandha*)¹⁶. The Abhidhānapadīpikā gives a verse list of forty-six names of Nibbāna¹⁷. Most or all of the terms in these lists are to be found scattered here and there throughout the Pāli Canon, either singly or in similar groups¹⁸.

2. Synonyms of Nirvāṇa according to Vasubandhu and Asaṅga

In addition to the Pāli parallel of the Asaṅkhasaṃyutta, there are two striking parallels to the Udānavarga-vivaraṇa citation in (originally Sanskrit) śāstra literature, as preserved in the Tibetan translation. In his *Gāthārthasaṃgraha-śāstra¹⁹, Vasubandhu

gives a list of synonyms (*paryāya*) of Nirvāṇa 'taught by the Lord', while Asaṅga devotes a section of his Abhidharma-samuccaya to synonyms of the truth of cessation (*nirodhasatya*), again called *paryāya*²⁰. Both texts give a commentary on each

saṃ-gra-ha-nāma (CD), *Śāstrangā-thā* (*tha* Q) *sa-martha-nāma* (GQ) = *bstan bcos tshigs su bcad pa bsdus pa zhes bya ba* (CDGQ). The forms with *śāstra* at the beginning rather than the end are awkward and unlikely; most probably the original Sanskrit titles were not transmitted, and at a later date the editors of the Tanjur created new, spurious ones. Cordier (*Catalogue du fonds tibétain de la Bibliothèque Nationale* III, Paris 1915, mdo 'grel LXXII §§ 4 and 5) restores the titles to *Gāthāsaṃgrahaśāstra-nāma* and *Gāthāsaṃgraha-śāstrārtha-nāma*. The first title presents no real problems. The essential element is *tshigs su bcad pa bsdus* = *gāthā-saṃgraha*, 'Compendium of Verses'; the full title could be either *Gāthā-saṃgraha-śāstra-nāma*, as given by Cordier, or *Gāthā-saṃgraha-nāma-śāstra*, in both cases 'Treatise entitled the Compendium of Verses'. The essential element of the second title is *tshigs su bcad pa'i don bsdus pa* = *gāthā-artha-saṃgraha* 'Compendium of the Meaning of Verses' — as given in the Tibetan of CD. I take the full title to be **Gāthārthasaṃgraha-śāstra-nāma* or **Gāthārthasaṃgraha-nāma-śāstra*, in both cases 'Treatise entitled the Compendium of the Meaning of Verses'. (Cordier's placing of the extraneous *śāstra* between *saṃgraha* and *artha* is untenable; another possibility might be **Gāthā-saṃgraha-artha-śāstra-nāma*, 'Treatise entitled the Meaning of the Compendium of Verses', but the order of the words in Tibetan is against this.) (For the Golden Tanjur, see P. Skilling, 'A Brief Guide to the Golden Tanjur', *The Journal of the Siam Society* 79/2 [1991] 138-46).

20 For this work — to be referred to as A-sam(T) — I have had access to two editions: D 4049, *sems tsam ri*, 91b1 ff; Q 5550, Vol.112, *sems tsam li*, 108b5 ff. The original Sanskrit of this section is lost, but the Sanskrit terms are given in the commentary, the Abhidharmasamuccayabhāṣyam (ed. N. Tatia, TSWS 17, Patna 1976 = A-sam-bh). I have also consulted the Tibetan translation of the latter, the Abhidharmasamuccaya-bhāṣya (Q 5554, Vol.113, *sems tsam shi* 67a5-68a8 = A-sam-bh[T]), as well as the Tibetan Abhidharmasamuccaya-vyākhyā (Q 5555, Vol.113, *sems tsam shi*, 255b6-257b7 = A-sam-vy). Cf. the Sanskrit reconstruction of Pralhad Pradhan, *Abhidharma-*

15 Kv pp.317 ff.

16 SyR Vol.31, 630.4-634 antepenult; PTS II 238.17-241.29.

17 Thai script ed., Mahāmakūṭarājavidyālaya, Bangkok BE 2508, p.4 (Ch.I, vv.6-9).

18 Cf the strings of near synonyms: *tāṇa leṇa dīpa saraṇa parāyaṇa*, A I 155.22, 156.17; *maṃdīpā maṃleṇā maṃtāṇā maṃsaraṇā*, S IV 315.30; *sarvasattvānāṃ layanaṃ trāṇaṃ saraṇaṃ parāyaṇaṃ*, Ekādaśamukha in Nalinaksha Dutt, *Gilgit Manuscripts*, Vol.1, [Srinagar 1939] Delhi 1984, p.38.2; *aśokaṃ virajaṃ kṣemaṃ dvīpaṃ lenaṃ parāyaṇaṃ . . . nirvāṇam*, in Gustav Roth (ed.) *Bhikṣuṇī-Vinaya*, Patna 1970, pp.51-5.

19 For this work I have consulted four editions: Cone xylograph (C), *mngon pa thu*, 257a1 ff; Derge xylograph (D) 4103, *mngon pa thu*, 258a5 ff; Golden Tanjur manuscript (G), *tshoms nu*, 361a4 ff; Peking (Qianlong) xylograph (Q) 5604, Vol.119, *mngon pa'i bstan bcos nu*, 282a5 ff. Vasubandhu is commenting on verse 19 of his *Gāthāsaṃgraha*, which is equivalent to Uv 13. The original Sanskrit titles of the two works are not certain, since they are not attested in any original Sanskrit works. At the head of the texts we find *Śāstra-gāthā-*

term. Vasubandhu's list may be divided into two parts, Asaṅga's into three; allowing for differences in translation, the first two lists of the two texts are identical, and must therefore have been based on similar Sanskrit originals.

Vasubandhu opens with 'by way of synonyms (*paryāya*): [as taught] by the Lord (*bhagavatā*)²¹; he then lists together the items given below in Groups A and B, followed by a commentary on each term. Asaṅga opens with the question, 'How [is the truth of cessation to be understood] by way of synonyms?'²². He then lists the 8 items of group A, followed by an 'etc.' (*la sogs pa*), after that he gives definitions of the 8 items, the 21 items of Group B and the 5 items of Group C. It is clear that Asaṅga's 'etc.' refers to the full list as given by Vasubandhu, plus the 5 'extra' items.

A. The first list consists of 6 terms which occur together in texts such as the Mānuṣyaka-sūtra (*mi'i mdo*)²³, the Catuspariṣat-

samuccaya of Asaṅga (Visva-Bharati Studies 12), Santiniketan 1950, pp.63.13-65.4 and the French translation of Walpola Rahula, *Le Compendium de la Super-Doctrine (Philosophie) (Abhidharmasamuccaya) d'Asaṅga*, Paris 1971, pp.101-4.

21 *Rnam grangs kyis ni ji skad du | bcom ldan 'das kyis . . . gsungs pa ste.*

22 *Rnam grangs kyis ji lta bu zhe na.*

23 The passage is cited by title by Śamathadeva in his *Abhidharmakośa-upāyikāṭikā*, Q 5585, Vol.118, *mdzod 'grel tu*, 113a2, and by Skandhila in his *Abhidharmāvatāra*, in Marcel van Velthem (ed., tr.), *Le Traité de la Descente dans la Profonde Loi (Abhidharmāvatārasāstra) de l'Arhat Skandhila*, Louvain-la-neuve 1977, p.108.29-31. The Tibetan of the latter agrees perfectly with that of the *Abhidharmasamuccaya*. In the Mānuṣyaka-sūtra, the list begins with *duḥkhasya* (*sdyg bsngal 'di*, *Abhidharmāvatāra*), which applies to each of the terms. A similar sūtra is cited in Candrakīrti's commentary on Āryadeva's *Catuḥśataka*: see the Sanskrit retranslated from the Tibetan in Bhagchandra Jain 'Bhaskar', *Āryadeva's Catuḥśatakam along with the Candrakīrti Vṛtti and Hindi*

sūtra and the Nidāna-saṃyukta²⁴. These are given in Table 2.

B. The second list is a collection of 21 synonyms, starting with *asaṃskṛta* and ending with Nirvāṇa. The beginning of the list is similar to that of the *Sūtrānta-peyāla, both in content and in order, as may be seen from Table 3. Since Vasubandhu specifies that his list was 'taught by the Lord', and since it is characteristic of Asaṅga's style to follow the sūtras closely without stating that he is doing so, it is probable that the two masters took their lists from a canonical counterpart of the *Sūtrānta-peyāla of Prajñāvarman, and that, since the latter gives only the beginning of the *Sūtrānta-peyāla list, the full text of the latter would be close to the full list of 21 items given by Vasubandhu and Asaṅga. This may be compared with the 33 synonyms of the Pāli *Asaṅkhatasamyyutta*.

C. The third group, given here only by Asaṅga, consists of 5 negatives (see Table 4). Here too the terms are drawn from the sūtras. A close parallel occurs in the Tibetan *Udānavarga*: *ma skyes pa, ma byun ba, ma bcos pa, 'dus ma byas pa, mi 'byung ba*²⁵; since Asaṅga himself cites this very sūtra in his *Yogācārabhūmi*, there can be little doubt that it is the source of his list²⁶. A Pāli counterpart occurs in the *Udāna* and the

Translation, Nagpur 1971, p.21.4 ad v.221 (IX 21). For another citation by title see Pradhan, *Abhidharmakośābhāṣya*, 465.10, 468.12.

24 See the references in n.38 below.

25 Siglinde Dietz and Champa Thupten Zongtse, *Udānavarga*, Band III, Göttingen 1990, XXVI 24-25. This prose passage is not found in Bernhard's Sanskrit edition; fragments are found in H. Nakatani, *Udānavarga de Subasi*, Vol.I, Paris 1987, § 368, pp.75-6.

26 The *Yogācārabhūmi* citation is given by Nakatani, *op. cit.*, p.76; Nakatani's source is Lambert Schmithausen, 'Zu den Rezensionen des *Udānavargaḥ*', *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens* 14 (1970), I.7.11 (not seen).

Itivuttaka (Ud 80.23; It 37), *ajātaṃ abhūtaṃ akataṃ asaṃkhatam*. Another possible parallel is a sūtra cited in Bhavya's Tarkajvalā, *dge slong dag / mya ngan las 'das pa de ni ma skyes pa dang / ma byung ba dang / 'dus ma byas nyid du uyod do*²⁷.

The same five negatives plus two more are given by Vasubandhu elsewhere in his Gāthārasaṃgraha, in commenting on the word dharma in the second citation of the Gāthārasaṃgraha (equivalent to Udānavarga 15:10). Here he classifies dharma as 'dharma as fruit, dharma as practice and dharma as teaching' (*phala-dharma, pratipatti-dharma, deśanā-dharma*); under *phala-dharma* he gives the five terms listed by Asaṅga plus *śānta* ('peaceful') and *gnas* ('abiding' = *sthita*?) followed by definitions²⁸. The definitions of the five terms common to Asaṅga and Vasubandhu are similar.

It is thus clear that all the synonyms of Nirvāṇa given by Vasubandhu and Asaṅga are drawn from sūtras of the (Mūla-) Sarvāstivādiṇs: Group A from the Mānuṣyaka-sūtra or a similar text, Group B perhaps from the *Sūtrānta-peyāla, and Group C from the Udānavarga. The Mānuṣyaka-sūtra belonged to the *Saḍāyatana-nipāta (of the Saṃyuktāgama)²⁹; the Sūtrānta-peyāla also most probably belonged to the Saṃyuktāgama.

27 Shotaro Iida, *Reason and Emptiness, A Study in Logic and Mysticism*, Tokyo 1980, p.199.1

28 C *thu*, 226a3; D *thu*, 226b6; G *nu*, 315a5; Q *nu*, 244b1: *ma skyes* (CD; GQ have *skyed* in list but *skyes* in definition) *pa, ma gyur pa, ma byas pa, 'dus ma byas pa, ma byung ba, zhi ba, gnas zhes bya ba de ni mya ngan las 'das pa'o*.

29 Śamathadeva, (Q) *thu*, 43a5, *skye mched drug gi tshogs*.

3. A citation from the Saṃyuktāgama

It is likely that the structure of the sūtras of the *Sūtrānta-peyāla was similar to that of the Pāli Asaṅkhatasaṃyutta. For a possible example, we may turn to the Sūtrasamuccaya, attributed to Nāgārjuna, which cites one such sūtra from the Saṃyuktāgama of an unnamed school³⁰:

yang dag par ldan pa'i lung las kyang / dge slong dag khyod la mya ngan las 'das pa dang mya ngan las 'das par 'gro ba'i lam bshad par bya'o // de la mya ngan las 'das gang zhe na / 'di lta ste 'dod chags zad pa dang / zhe sdang zad pa dang / gti mug zad pa'o // de la mya ngan las 'das par 'gro ba'i lam gang zhe na / 'phags pa'i lam yan lag brgyad 'di nyid do shes gsungs so //

It is taught in the Saṃyuktāgama:

I will teach you, O monks, of Nirvāṇa and of the path leading to Nirvāṇa (*nirvāṇa-gāmi-mārga*). Herein (*tatra*), what is Nirvāṇa? It is thus (*tadyathā*): the destruction of attachment (*rāgakṣaya*), the destruction of aversion (*dveṣakṣaya*), the destruction of delusion (*mohakṣaya*). Herein, what is the path leading to Nirvāṇa? It is this very (*ayam eva*) Noble Eightfold Path (*āryāṣṭāṅgika mārga*).

According to the arrangement of the Asaṅkhatasaṃyutta, Nāgārjuna's citation is equivalent to the eleventh sutta dealing

30 Bhikkhu Pāsādika, *Nāgārjuna's Sūtrasamuccaya: A Critical Edition of the mDo kun las btus pa* (Fontes Tibetici Havnienses II), Copenhagen 1989, p.122.5–11. Cf. English translation by Bhikkhu Pāsādika in *Linh-Son Publication d'Études Bouddhologiques* (LSPÉB), No.13, Paris, December 1980, p.42.

with Nibbāna which, when expanded, reads as follows:

Nibbānaṃ ca vo bhikkhave desessāmi nibbānagāmiṃ ca maggaṃ . . . Katamaṃ ca bhikkhave nibbānaṃ? Yo bhikkhave rāgakkhayo dosakkhayo mohakkhayo. Idaṃ vuccati bhikkhave nibbānaṃ. Katamo ca bhikkhave nibbānagāmiṃ maggo? Ariyo aṭṭhaṅgiko maggo. Ayaṃ vuccati bhikkhave nibbānagāmiṃ maggo.

I will teach you, O monks, of Nibbāna and of the path leading to Nibbāna. And what, O monks, is Nibbāna? This, O monks, destruction of attachment, destruction of aversion, destruction of delusion: this, O monks, is called Nibbāna. And what, O monks, is the path leading to Nibbāna? The Noble Eightfold Path: this, O monks, is called the path leading to Nibbāna.

Apart from a number of formal differences, the structure and contents of the two discourses are the same.

4. Conclusions

The *Sūtrānta-peyāla cited by Prajñāvarman most probably refers to an abbreviated collection of sūtras dealing with Nirvāṇa, similar to the Pāli Asaṅkhatasāmyutta and was probably parallel to the text(s) utilised by Vasubandhu and Asaṅga for their lists of synonyms of Nirvāṇa and of *nirodhasatyā* respectively. It might therefore have contained about 21 items, against the 33 of the Asaṅkhatasāmyutta. The structure of the individual sūtras to be expanded from the *peyālas* most probably resembled that of the Asaṅkhatasāmyutta suttas and of the single Saṃyuktāgama citation of the Sūtrasamuccaya; however, while the source of Prajñāvarman's, Vasubandhu's and Asaṅga's citations would have been a canonical (Mūla-) Sarvāstivādin text, the school of the Saṃyuktāgama cited in the Sūtrasamuccaya is not known. Like the Pāli Asaṅkhatasāmyutta

and Nāgārjuna's citation, the source cited by Prajñāvarman, Vasubandhu and Asaṅga would most probably have belonged to the Saṃyuktāgama.

Prajñāvarman's and Nāgārjuna's citations are doubly interesting here since, according to Akanuma's catalogue³¹, neither the Pāli Asaṅkhatasāmyutta nor a single sutta contained therein has any parallels in the Chinese Āgamas. Thus the two citations are the sole representatives of that Saṃyutta discovered in the literature of other schools to date. It is generally held that the two recensions of the Saṃyuktāgama found in Chinese translation belong to the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivādin tradition; this is the tradition of Prajñāvarman, yet no parallel to his citation is found in either of these recensions.

A cursory examination of this section of Akanuma's catalogue dealing with the Saṃyutta-nikāya shows that while, in some cases, Pāli *saṃyuttas* or *vaggas* that consist essentially of *peyālas* have corresponding texts in Chinese, in many cases they do not. On the whole, the Saṃyutta-nikāya shows a much greater tendency towards the reproduction of *peyāla* texts than does the Saṃyuktāgama as transmitted in two Chinese versions. This might suggest that the use of *peyālas* found more favour with the Theravādins than with the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivādins. However, on the basis of Prajñāvarman's and Nāgārjuna's citations and of Vasubandhu's and Asaṅga's lists, it seems that parallels to the Pāli Asaṅkhatasāmyutta were indeed transmitted by the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivādins and perhaps other schools, even

³¹ Chizen Akanuma, *The Comparative Catalogue of Chinese Āgamas and Pāli Nikāyas*, Nagoya 1929, pp.233-5.

though they have not been preserved in Chinese translation³². The parallel texts were available in the time of Nāgārjuna (second century?), Aśaṅga (fourth century), Vasubandhu (fourth-fifth centuries) and Prajñāvarman (eighth century or later?).

Appendix

For number 3 of Prajñāvarman's list, *mi 'gyur ba*, 'unchanging', there are many possible Sanskrit equivalents: the least unlikely in the context being perhaps *avipariṇāma* which is used as an epithet of Nibbāna in the Paṭisambhidāmagga (*avipariṇāmadhamma*, II 240.17). The parallel Pāli or Tibetan texts discussed in this article do not give this or any other possible equivalent. The two Tibetan parallels have here *mi g'yo ba / g'yo ba med pa*, 'unshakeable, unmoving' = *acala* (see Table 3, No.3).

Number 4, *mtha' yas pa = ananta* ('endless'), though possible as an epithet of Nirvāṇa, is probably either an accurate translation of a faulty Sanskrit manuscript of the UvViv reading *amaṃta*, or a misreading of a correct manuscript reading *anata*: the single dot representing the *anusvāra* could easily have been added by a scribe or by the translators to make a more familiar reading. The same place in the lists of Vasubandhu and Aśaṅga (see Table 3) is occupied by '*dud pa med pa*. Since '*dud* = NAM, 'to bend, turn towards, aim at', '*dud pa med pa = anata*, 'unbent'. Although in some cases the texts read *mdud pa = grantha*, 'bond', confusion between the prefixes *ma-* and '*a chung* before *da* is very common in Tibetan texts, and I

32 While the *Sūtrānta-peyāla of the Udānavarga-vivarāṇa seems to refer to a *peyāla* collection similar to the Pāli Aśaṅkhatasāmyutta, the title is somewhat baffling: one would expect something more specific, such as Aśaṅskṛta- or Nirvāṇa-peyāla.

therefore take the correct reading to be '*dud pa med pa = anata*, 'unbent'³³. The entire *Gāthārthasaṃgrahaśāstra and the section of the Abhidharmasamuccaya in question are lost in the original Sanskrit, but the Bhāṣya on the latter has been preserved and reads *anata* (A-sam-bh 75.3): 'unbent: because in the absence of craving for the Sensual, Form or Formless [Worlds], it does not bend towards such forms of existence' (*anataṃ kāmarūpārūpyatṛṣṇā bhavena bhaveṣv anamanāt*). Here the use of *anamana* clearly shows that the reading *anata*, root NAM, is the correct one. With this we may compare Vasubandhu's definition (C 257b1; D 258b5; G 362a2; Q 282b7): 'unbent: since it is free of the three cravings: in the absence of craving for the Sensual, Form or Formless [Worlds], it does not bend towards rebirth' (reading *skyed pa* with C, or correcting the *sred pa = trṣṇā* of GQ to *srid pa = bhava*?) (*mdud pa med pa ni sred pa gsum dang me ldan pa'i phyir te / [CDQ: ro // G] 'dod pa dang / gzugs dang / zgugs med pa'i sred pa med pas skyed [C: sred GQ (D copy n/a)] pa la mdud pa med pa'i phyir ro*).

Aśaṅga gives a briefer definition, expanded in the two commentaries:

A-sam(T) (D 91b5; Q 109a3): 'Why is [the truth of cessation] called unbent? Because it is free of the three cravings' (*ci'i phyir mi 'dud pa [mdud pa med pa Q] zhes bya zhe na / sred pa gsum dang bral ba'i phyir ro*).

A-sam-bh(T) (Q 67b5): 'unbent: because in the absence of craving for the Sensual, Form or Formless [Worlds], it does not

33 Since *mdud pa* is equivalent to *grantha*, a synonym of *kleśa*, the term is acceptable in meaning — **agrantha*/**nirgrantha* in the sense of *niśkleśa*, which would roughly fit Aśaṅga's and Vasubandhu's definitions — but I have not seen such a term as a synonym of Nirvāṇa in the early sūtras.

bend towards such forms of existence' (*mi 'dud pa ni 'dod pa dang gzugs dang gzugs med pa'i sred pa med pas srid par mi 'dud pa'i phyir ro*).

A-sam-vy (Q 256b3): 'Why is [the truth of cessation] unbent? Because it is free of the three existences (*srid pa = bhava*; correct to *sred pa = trṣṇā?*): in the absence of craving for the Sensual, Form or Formless [Worlds], it does not bend' (*ci'i phyir mi mdud pa srid pa gsum dang bral ba'i phyir ro // 'dod pa dang gzugs dang / gzugs med pa'i sred pa med pas mi mdud pa'i phyir ro*).

Anata is also given as an epithet of Nibbāna in the *Asaṅkhatasamyutta* (PTS, Chaṭṭhasaṅgīti and Syāmrāṭṭha editions: see Table 1A, § 2). The citation of the *uddāna* of the *Asaṅkhatasamyutta* in the *Nettipakaraṇa* reads *ananta* in place of *anata* in the PTS (Nett 55.6), Chaṭṭhasaṅgīti (47.8) and Thai script Bhūmibalo Bhikkhu Foundation (80.13) editions. The *Abhidhānapadīpika* (1:7) also has *ananta* in both the Thai script Mahāmakūṭarājavidyālaya (see n.17) and the Burmese script Thudhammawadi Press editions. Here too the *lectio difficilior anata* could easily have been changed to *anamta* by the addition of *anusvāra*, and then to *ananta*. I therefore prefer *anata* in all cases.

Table 1A: Synonyms of *asaṅkhata* in the *Asaṅkhatasamyutta*¹

1.	asaṅkhata	unconditioned	Ps II 240.36
2.	anata	unbent	
3.	anāsava	untainted	Ps II 240.33
4.	sacca	truth	
5.	pāra	further shore	
6.	nīpuna	subtle	S I 136.10,13; Thag 26
7.	sududdassa	very difficult to see	S I 136.9,13
8.	ajajara	unageing	
9.	dhuva	enduring	Ps II 239.28
10.	apalokita	undecaying	Cp. Ps II 239.6
11.	anidassana	invisible	
12.	nippapañca	undiversifying	
13.	santa	peace	Vin I 36.26; S I 136.10
14.	amata	deathless	S V 8.15-20; Ps II 241.15
15.	pañita	excellent	S I 136.10
16.	siva	bliss	S I 181.17
17.	khema	security	A III 354.28; Sn 268; Thag 227; Thīg 361; S I 136.16 [Khp 3
18.	tanhakkhaya	destruction of craving	
19.	acchariya	wonderful	
20.	abbhuta	marvellous	
21.	anītika	freedom from ill	Ps II 239.10; Nid I 443
22.	anītikadhamma	the state of freedom from ill	
23.	nibbāna	nibbāna	S I 136.16
24.	avyāpajjha	freedom from harm	
25.	virāga	absence of passion	S I 136.16
26.	suddhi	purity	
27.	mutti	release	
28.	anālaya	freedom from bias	
29.	dīpa	island	1B 46
30.	lena	shelter	Ps II 239.34; 1B 40
31.	tāṇa	protection	Ps II 239.31; 1B 41
32.	saraṇa	refuge	Ps II 239.37
33.	parāyaṇa	goal	

1 In the right-hand column I give a few references (by no means exhaustive) to occurrences of the terms in canonical texts, along with cross-references to the other lists.

Table 1B: Synonyms of asaṅkhata in the Nettipakaraṇa

1-23 = <i>uddāna</i> of the Asaṅkhata-saṃyutta (as in Table 1A)		
24. ajāta	unborn	C1
25. abhūta	un arisen	C2
26. anupaddava	unoppressed	Ps II 239.13; Nid I 443
27. akata	unmade	C4
28. asoka	sorrowless	Vin I 40.35; S IV 210.19 = A IV 157.14 = 160.3; Ps II 241.18
29. visoka	freedom from sorrow	
30. anupasagga	untroubled	Ps II 239.19; Nid I 443
31. anupasagga-dhamma ¹	freedom from trouble	
32. gambhīra	profound	S I 136.23
33. duppassa	difficult to see	= 1A 7
34. uttara	surpassing	
35. anuttara	unsurpassed	S I 181.17
36. asama	unequalled	
37. appaṭisama	incomparable	
38. jetṭha	foremost	
39. seṭṭha	best ²	
40. leṇa	shelter	1A 30
41. tāṇa	protection	1A 31
42. arāna	freedom from conflict	
43. anaṅgana	unblemished	
44. akāca	flawless	
45. vimala	immaculate ³	
46. dīpa	island	1A 29
47. sukha	happiness	Ps II 238.21
48. appamāṇa	limitless	
49. paṭiṭṭhā	support	
50. akiñcana	no-thing	Vin I 36.26
51. appapañca	non-diversified	1A 12

1 At this point Nett (55.17) repeats the phrase *nibbānam etaṃ sugatena desitaṃ*, common to the Asaṅkhata-saṃyutta.

2 For 38 and 39, cf. A IV 176.18, *jetṭho seṭṭho*. Cp. English 'first and foremost'.

3 For 44 and 45, cp. D II 244.10, *maṇi yathā veḷuriyo akāco vimalo subho*.

Table 2: Synonyms of Nirvāṇa, Group A

Vasubandhu	Asaṅga	Sanskrit ¹
1. ma lus par spangs pa	ma lus par spangs pa	aśeṣa-prahāṇa
2. so sor spangs pa	nges par spangs pa	pratiniḥsarga
3. mthar byas pa ²	byang bar gyur pa	vyantibhāva
4. zad pa	zad pa	kṣaya
5. 'dod chags dang bral ba	'dod chags dang ³ bral ba	virāga
6. 'gog pa	'gog pa	nirodha
7. nye bar zhi ba	mam par zhi ba	vyupaśama
8. nub pa	nub pa	astamgama

Table 4: Synonyms of Nirvāṇa, Group C

Asaṅga ⁴			Vasubandhu ⁵
1. ma skyes pa	ajāta	unborn	1. ma skyes pa ⁶
2. ma byung ba	abhūta	un arisen	2. ma gyur pa
3. ma byas pa	akṛta	unmade	3. ma byas pa
4. 'dus ma byas pa	asaṃskṛta	unconditioned	4. 'dus ma byas pa
5. skye ba med pa ⁷	asamutpanna	unproduced	5. ma byung pa
—	—	peaceful	6. zhi ba
—	—	abiding	7. gnas

1 Sanskrit from A-sam-bh 93.27-28 and P. Pradhan (ed.) *Abhidharmakośa-bhāṣyam of Vasubandhu*, Patna 1975, 2:55, p.93, 27-28; Ernst Waldschmidt, *Das Catuspariśatsūtra Teil II*, Berlin 1957; § 14.9; Chandrabhāl Tripāṭhī, *Fünfund-zwanzig Sūtras des Nidānasamyukta*, Berlin 1962, § 23.9d. See n.23.

2 CDQ; G has *mathar phyin byas pa* in the definition.

3 Q inserts a *daṇḍa* (*śad*) after *dang*; not in D.

4 D 92a4, Q 109b3; Sanskrit from A-sam-bh 75.15-20.

5 References in n.28.

6 GQ have *skyed* in the opening list, *skyes* in the definition.

7 A-sam DQ; A-sam-vy; *skyes pa med pa* A-sam-bh(T).

Table 3: Synonyms of Nirvāṇa, Group B

Vasubandhu	Asaṅga	UvViv	Sanskrit equivalents ¹	S parallels
1. 'dus ma byas pa	'dus ma byas	1. 'dus ma byas pa	asamskṛta, unconditioned	(1) asankhata
2. mthong bar dka' ba	bita dka' ba	2. lta bar dka' ba	durdṛṣya, difficult to see	(7) sudurdassa
3. mi g'yo ba	g'yo ba med pa	3. mi 'gyur ba	acala, unshakable	—
4. mdud pa med pa ²	mdud pa med pa ³	4. mtha' yas pa	anata, unbent	(2) anata
5. 'chi ba med pa ⁴	'chi ba med pa	—	ananta, endless	—
6. zag pa med pa	zag pa med pa	5. zag pa med pa	amata, deathless	(14) amata
7. gnas	gnas	6. gnas	anāsrava, unstained	(3) anāsava
8. gling	gling	7. gling	layana, shelter	(30) lena
9. skyob pa	skyob pa	8. skyob pa	dvīpa, island	(29) dīpa
10. skyabs ⁵	mgom ⁶	etc.	trāna, protection	(31) tāna
11. dpung gnyen	dpung gnyen	—	śaraṇa, refuge	(32) sarana
12. ma nyams pa	'chi 'pho med pa ⁷	—	parāyana, goal	(33) parāyana
13. rims nad med pa	rims nad med pa	—	acyuta, unfallen	—
14. yongs su gdung ba med pa	yongs su gdung ba med pa	—	nirvāra, absence of fever	—
15. bde ba	bde ba	—	nispāṇidāna, absence of burning	—
16. zhi ba	zhi ba	—	kṣema, security	(17) kherma
17. gzhi bzang po	bde ba 'i gzhi ⁸	—	śīva, peace	(16) siva
18. bde legs su byed pa	bde bar 'gyur ba ¹⁰	—	sauvastika, ⁹ auspiciousness	—
19. nad med pa	nad med pa	—	svastyayana, well-being	—
20. mi g'yo ba	mi g'yo ba	—	āṅgya, freedom from illness	—
21. mya ngan las 'das pa	mya ngan las 'das pa	—	āninyiya, unshaken	—
			nirvāna	(23) nibbāna

¹ The Sanskrit equivalents are from the A-sam-bh 75.1-14.

² See Appendix.

³ Q : mi 'dud pa D 91b5, A-sam-bh(T) 67b5 : mi mdud pa A-sam-vy 256b3.

⁴ mi 'chi ba in following definition, CDGQ.

⁵ CD : GQ omit. Since skyabs is given in the definitions at G 362a5 and Q 283a3, the omission must be due to a scribal error.

⁶ skyabs A-sam-vy 256b7.

⁷ D, A-sam-bh(T), A-sam-vy. Q has cancellation mark (two dots) over the 'a chung of 'pho.

⁸ Q, A-sam-vy : bde gzhi D, A-sam-bh(T).

⁹ The A-sam-bh has here *sauvastika*, "golden" (cf. BHSD 607b), which is quite unlikely. The Tibetan of Vasubandhu is composed of *gzhi = vastu + bzang po = su*; that of Asaṅga of *bde* (D, A-sam-bh(T)) or *bde ba 'i* (Q, A-sam-vy) = *sukha, su + gzhi = vastu*. Both Tibetan versions and the definition at A-sam-bh 75.11, *lokottara-sukha-vastuvāt* (A-sam-bh(T) 68a3, *bde gzhi mi 'yig rten las 'das pa 'i bde ba 'i gzhi yin pa 'i phyir ro*, A-sam-vy 257a4, *ci 'i phyir bde ba 'i gzhi? don dam pa 'i bde ba 'i gzhi yin pa 'i phyir ro*) suggest the otherwise unattested **sauvastika*. *Sauvastika* (for which cf. BHSD 607b) seems probable since it is related to the following term, *svastyayana*.

¹⁰ Q, A-sam-bh(T) : *dge bar gyur pa D : dge bar 'gyur ba A-sam-vy*.